Purpose of each paragraph in the submit-sample[‡]

Introduction

- 1. Present methods that use isotopic content to estimate crystal formation temperatures may be inaccurate.
- 2. Surface processes on ice may influence temperature reconstructions of ice in currently unknown ways.
- 3. This paper shows that the effect of surface fractionation may be large.

2.1

4. Surface processes affect ice crystal growth and thus may affect fractionation.

2.2

- 5. Quantify and describe the net flux of water species into vapor-grown ice.
- 6. Quantify and describe how growth impedance reduces the supersaturation and hinders growth.
- 7. Describe physically the two bulk impedances.
- 8. Describe physically the surface impedance.

3

- 9. Define the fractionation coefficient and derive its dependence on the impedances.
- 10. The coefficient agrees with previous results and shows the importance of gas speeds and deposition coefficients.
- 11. Physically link the various processes that cause fractionation. Emphasize *x*.

[‡] See the sample manuscript at <u>http://www.redmondphysicalsciences.com/submitsample.pdf</u>

- 12. Absolute values of the deposition coefficients also affect fractionation, but these must be calculated numerically.
- 13. Fractionation depends on the impedance ratios z and x.
- 14. When z exceeds unity and x differs by 5% from the diffusion constant ratio (d'), the fractionation significantly differs from previous theory (Fig. 2).
- 15. When x differs from d' by more than 5%, the same result occurs even when z doesn't exceed unity.

4.1

- 16. A cylindrical crystal better fits real crystals and adds two features.
- 17. Each face has its own fractionation coefficient and impedances, with formulas given elsewhere.
- 18. To calculate the surface impedance, we use the value at the corner because it controls the rate of growth.
- 19. The net fractionation is a weighted average of the fractionation to each face.
- 20. Crystal shape can lower or raise fractionation at high z.
- 21. As with the sphere case, when z is large, small changes to x greatly affect fractionation.

4.2

- 22. Non-facet regions also contribute to fractionation (show equation).
- 23. On stellar-type crystals, about 80% of the mass uptake is through non-facet regions.
- 24. For hollow crystals, up to about 60% of the mass uptake is through the non-facet (hollow) regions.

Discussion

- 25. In many regions, the crystals are largely non-facetted, but polar regions have largely facetted crystals.
- 26. The inferred temperature from isotopic records could be up to about 15 °C off.
- 27. New experiments are needed to evaluate the surface fractionation effect.
- 28. With knowledge of the fractionation relations for both HDO and $H_2^{18}O$, one could infer the deposition temperature and supersaturation of an ice sample.

Conclusions

29. Surface kinetic fractionation may significantly affect isotope fractionation, but new experiments are needed.

Appendix A

30. Describe the vapor impedance.

Appendix B

31. The deposition coefficient ratio may reasonably range between 0.8 and 1.2.

Appendix C

32. Describe an empirical relation for the deposition coefficient for a spherical crystal as a function of crystal size and external conditions.